Writing a Rebuttal

Steps:

1. Read all reviews in detail

2. Copy out all statements that have questions, criticism, suggestions for improvement from each review

3. For each of these statement make a short version (bullet points, short sentence) in your own words

4. Sort the all the extracted statements by topic

5. Combine all statements that address the same issue

6. Order the combined statements according to priority (highest priority to primary reviewer)

7. For each combined statement decide if the criticism is justified, misunderstood, or unjustified

8. CORE: make a response for each combined statement

9. Create a rebuttal that addresses as many points as possible, without being short (trade-off in the number of issue to address and detail one can give)

There are three basic options:

A. If justified: acknowledge that this is an issue and propose how to fix it

B. If misunderstood: explain again and propose you will improve the explanation in the final version

C. If unjustified: explain that this point may be disputed and provide additional evidence why you think it should be as it is

The easiest and most effective way is to make your rebuttal a pragmatic and directed document. Use the reviewers' own words to help them remember their feedback, and respond to that feedback directly. If the primary reviewer (1AC) gave a list of concerns to respond to, use those exact concerns, and in that exact order, to structure the rebuttal. Use those point names and numbers, if they have them. Favor brevity and directness in your responses.

Tips:

a. Thank the reviewers and acknowledge good comments. Agree with your reviewers. Don't argue directly, but persuade.

b. Offer concrete changes that are responsive to reviewers' comments. If short on related work, put in a paragraph or two that relate your work to the papers the reviewers suggested were missing.

c. Read your reviews with another coauthor and have an in-depth discussion.

d. Do not say that the draft will be improved with a major change.

e. Specify how the camera ready version will be reflected based on the reviewer's request.

Links

Writing Rebuttals (Niklas Elmqvist): https://tinyurl.com/y59v7kks
SIGCHI Rebuttals (Albrecht Schmidt): https://tinyurl.com/y22q2n7q
Writing CHI Rebuttals (Gene Golovchinsky): https://palblog.fxpal.com/?p=5001
How to Write SIGCHI Rebuttals (Hyunyoung Song): https://tinyurl.com/yxz8rk69